

Claremont Graduate University
School of Social Science, Policy, and Evaluation
Spring 2020

SP&E 312 Public-Private Partnerships

Class Instructor

Robert Klitgaard, University Professor
Office: Harper 57
Phone: (909) 607-4314; cell (909) 257-4175
E-mail: robert.klitgaard@cgu.edu
Office hours: Tuesdays 9–11:45 a.m. or by appointment

Class Schedule

Semester start/end dates: January 21 to May 16. This course begins Tuesday, Jan. 21.
Meeting day, time: Tuesdays 4:00–6:50
Course location: McManus 33

Overview

Description in Course Catalogue

Collaboration across government, business, and civil society is growing in importance for entrepreneurs, leaders, and managers. In areas from health care to education, from financial reform to the provision of infrastructure, effective action is no longer the province of just government or just business. In this course, students consider how to design and manage collaboration across the public-private-nonprofit divide. Along the way, they have the chance to reconsider deeper questions about entrepreneurship, leadership, and service.

Longer Description

From health care to education, from the provision of infrastructure to grassroots development, we must go beyond the old duality of “leave it to the state” or “privatize it.” But what does “go beyond” mean?

This course explores how to design, lead, and manage public-private partnerships. We examine theoretical approaches, especially in economics, to analyze when various forms of collaboration make sense. We consider the practical challenges of making public-private partnerships work, using outstanding case studies. Along the way, we reconsider the meaning and practice of public policy.

Examples are drawn from public health, education, international development, urban renewal, infrastructure, minimum-wage reforms, anti-corruption initiatives, and more.

Student Learning Outcomes

By the end of this course, students will be able to:

1. Appraise the distinctive contributions of different kinds of organizations to address public policy issues.
2. Apply tools of leadership and management to public-private partnerships.
3. Evaluate partnerships in terms of each member, the partnership as an entity, and the attainment of public purposes.

Prerequisites

There are no curricular prerequisites. (Claremont Graduate University's description of grading standards, requirements, and other matters appears at the end of this syllabus.)

Evaluation

Class Participation

Please be well prepared for class discussions, including of course doing the assigned readings in advance. Readings are available on Canvas or will be distributed in class.

Your participation in class counts for 25 percent of your final grade. Many classes, especially in the last half of the course, employ the case method. This form of learning involves you in real examples of design and management. In all our sessions, and especially in these case discussions, your careful preparation and enthusiastic participation are keys to your learning experience—and to the class's. If for some reason you are unable to come to a class or to prepare for it fully, please let Prof. Klitgaard know in advance via email.

Mid-Term Examination

The mid-term examination on **March 10** counts for 25 percent of your final grade. This examination will be open-book and open-notes.

Course Project

In transdisciplinary teams of three students, you will write and present a case study of collaboration across the public-private divide.

Unlike the usual graduate-school paper, you are not expected to slog through a long, established literature, and the number of references and footnotes is not "the point." Rather, you will assess the accomplishments of the particular partnership and how it was designed and implemented. More details will be supplied in early February.

An initial two-page prospectus is due before 5:00 p.m. on Sunday, February 16.

Teams will make presentations on their projects in class on **April 21** and **April 28**. The final version will be no longer than 5000 words (about 20 pages double-spaced), not counting references or tables, and it is due before 5:00 p.m. on Sunday, **May 10**. This assignment counts for 50 percent of your final grade. We will discuss in class possible subjects for your case study. On you will present drafts of your case study for class discussion.

There is no final examination.

Schedule and Assignments

* Readings marked with an asterisk are optional.

January 21

Introduction of participants. Why is public-private-nonprofit collaboration so important today for leaders and managers in business, government, education, and civil society?

Case Study: Preventing Dropouts

"Partnership for Dealing with Dropouts (A)," 8 pages. Available on Canvas.

Assignment (nothing to write or submit)

As preparation for class discussion, please consider the following questions:

1. What do you see as the advantages and disadvantages of a cross-age tutoring program?
2. What do you judge to be the critical activities that should be considered part of the program?
3. How might the partners combine forces in implementation?

January 28

Some examples

Bertrand Quelin. 2015. "Are Public-Private Partnerships the Best Way to Provide Government Services?" *Yale Insights*. 20 October. 5 pp. <https://insights.som.yale.edu/insights/are-public-private-partnerships-the-best-way-to-provide-government-services>

Kriston Capps. 2017. "How Local Governments Came to Embrace Business Partnerships" *CityLab*, November 10, 5 pp. <https://www.citylab.com/solutions/2017/11/local-governments-partner-with-business/542487/>

Howard W. Buffett and William B. Eimicke. 2018. "How Companies, Governments, and Nonprofits Can Create Social Change Together" *Harvard Business Review*. 31 May. <https://hbr.org/2018/05/how-companies-governments-and-nonprofits-can-create-social-change-together>

Spend a half hour looking at the World Bank's resources on public-private partnerships:

<https://pppknowledgelab.org/guide/sections/83-what-is-the-ppp-reference-guide>

Urvashi Prasad. 2018. "India's economy is growing fast, but its poorest areas lag behind. Here's why this could be about to change" *World Economic Forum*. 14 June. 3 pp.

<https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2018/06/transforming-india-human-development-indicators-adp>

Courtney A. Schultz and Cassandra Moseley. 2019. "Collaborations and Capacities to Transform Fire Management," *Science* 366, no. 6461 (4 October): 38–40.

<https://science.sciencemag.org/content/366/6461/38.full?ijkey=W9MRgl2YDdEGs&keytype=ref&siteid=sci>

DOI: 10.1126/science.aay3727

Assignment (nothing to write or submit)

1. Please consider examples you know of collaboration across the public-private divide, and think about their advantages and disadvantages. Be prepared to discuss them in class.
2. Browse the case studies of the Intersector project: <http://intersector.com/cases/>
3. Be prepared to discuss possible topics for your course project.

February 4

Some Design Principles

Please begin on this list of readings, which we will be covering over the next weeks.

Robert Klitgaard and Gregory F. Treverton. 2004. "Assessing Partnerships: New Forms of Collaboration," in *Collaboration: Using Networks and Partnerships*, ed. John M. Kamensky and Thomas J. Burlin. Lanham, MD and Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield, pp. 21–59. Earlier version is here: <http://www.businessofgovernment.org/sites/default/files/Assessing%20Partnerships.pdf>

Timothy Besley and Maitreesh Ghatak. 2017. "Public-Private Partnerships for the Provision of Public Goods: Theory and an Application to NGOs" *Research in Economics* 71(2): 356–71. <http://personal.lse.ac.uk/ghatak/NGO-new.pdf>

Elinor Ostrom. 2010. "Beyond Markets and States: Polycentric Governance of Complex Economic Systems," *American Economic Review*, 100(3): 641–72. https://www.nobelprize.org/nobel_prizes/economic-sciences/laureates/2009/ostrom_lecture.pdf

Dennis R. Young. 2000. "Alternative Models of Government-Nonprofit Sector Relations: Theoretical and International Perspectives" *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly* 29(1): 149–72. <http://nvs.sagepub.com/content/29/1/149.full.pdf+html>

* Lester M. Salamon and Stefan Toepler. 2015. "Government–Nonprofit Cooperation: Anomaly or Necessity?" *VOLUNTAS: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organizations*. 26(6): 2155-2177.

* Eric Werker and Faisal Z. Ahmed. 2008. "What Do Nongovernmental Organizations Do?" *Journal of Economic Perspectives*. 22(2): 73–92. https://www.hbs.edu/faculty/Publication%20Files/JEP_What%20Do%20Nongovernmental%20Organizations%20Do_107739f7-c4df-4348-bf91-70322e8774ba.pdf

* Michael E. Porter *et al.* 2012. "Measuring Shared Value: How to Unlock Value by Linking Social and Business Results." Boston: FSG. https://www.hbs.edu/faculty/Publication%20Files/Measuring_Shared_Value_57032487-9e5c-46a1-9bd8-90bd7f1f9cef.pdf

* Anthony E. Boardman, Carsten Greve, and Graeme A. Hodge. 2015. "Comparative Analyses of Infrastructure Public-Private Partnerships," *Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis: Research and Practice*, 17:5: 441–7.

[https://www.researchgate.net/publication/284785990 Comparative Analyses of Infrastructure Public-Private Partnerships](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/284785990_Comparative_Analyses_of_Infrastructure_Public-Private_Partnerships)

February 11

Collaboration across government agencies and levels

1. Please read:

Robert Klitgaard. 1991. *Adjusting to Reality: Beyond "State vs. Market" in International Development*. San Francisco: ICS Press and International Center for Economic Growth, ch. 9 (pp. 139–167). http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf_docs/PNABK787.pdf

2. Case study:

Jennifer Widner. 2018. "All Hands on Deck: The US Response to West Africa's Ebola Crisis, 2014-2015" *Innovations for Successful Societies*, Princeton University. June. 42 pp.

https://successfulsocieties.princeton.edu/sites/successfulsocieties/files/JW_Ebola_USResponse_Final_June%2028%202018_JRG_0.pdf

Assignment (nothing to write or submit)

Please apply Klitgaard's policy framework for the integration of public services to Widner's case study. Be prepared to discuss in class.

February 18

The design and management of public-private partnerships

1. Please read:

Kirk Emerson, Tina Nabatchi, and Steve Balogh. 2012. "An Integrative Framework for Collaborative Governance." *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*. 22(1): 1–29.

<https://academic.oup.com/jpart/article/22/1/1/944908>

Robert Picciotto. 1995. *Putting Institutional Economics to Work: From Participation to Governance*. World Bank Discussion Paper 304. Washington, D.C: The World Bank.

<http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/495941468739314632/pdf/multi-page.pdf>

* Barbara Gray and Jill Purdy. 2018. *Collaborating for Our Future: Multistakeholder Partnerships for Solving Complex Problems*. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press.

2. Case study:

Eric Houser, with Craig Thomas and Stephen Page. 2018. "Combat and Collaboration in Seattle's Historic Minimum Wage Debate." *E-PARCC Collaborative Governance Initiative*, Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs, Syracuse University. 29 pp.

<https://www.maxwell.syr.edu/uploadedFiles/parcc/eparcc/cases/Houser-%20Seattle's%20Fight%20for%2015-%20Case.pdf>

February 25

Implementing partnerships

Lynn Barendsen et al. 2013. *The Good Collaboration Toolkit: An Approach to Building, Sustaining, and Carrying Out Successful Collaboration*. Cambridge, MA: The Good Project, Harvard University, pp. 7–48. Available on Canvas.

Have a look at <https://participedia.net/en/about> and the many examples therein.

CollaborateUp. 2018. *Backbone Organizations: A Field Guide. 27 Ways to Drive Impact in Multi-Stakeholder Initiatives*. 22 pp. https://ssir.org/pdf/Backbone_Organizations_Field_Guide.pdf

March 3

Garrett Hardin. 1968. “The Tragedy of the Commons” *Science*, 162(3859): 1243–8. 13 December. <http://science.sciencemag.org/content/162/3859/1243>

Robert Boyd et al. 2018. “Tragedy Revisited” *Science*, 362(6420): 1236–41. 14 December. <http://science.sciencemag.org/content/362/6420/1236.full>

Brett M. Frischmann, Alain Marciano, and Giovanni Battista Ramello. 2019. “The Tragedy of the Commons after 50 Years” *The Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 33, no. 4 (Fall): 211–28. Available via Honnold-Mudd Library online.

Case Study: Irrigation systems and forests in Nepal

Robert Klitgaard. 2020. *The Culture and Development Manifesto*. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, ch. 10, especially the part about Elinor Ostrom. On Canvas.

March 10

Mid-term examination.

March 17

Spring Break

March 24

A high-tech public-private partnership

Vijay Sathe. 2011. “The World’s Most Ambitious ID Project” *Innovations* 6(2): 39–66. Available on Canvas.

* Piali Mukhopadhyay, Karthik Muralidharan, Paul Niehaus, and Sandip Sukhtankar. 2013. “Implementing a Biometric Payment System: The Andhra Pradesh Experience,” May. [http://econweb.ucsd.edu/~kamuralidharan/papers/Other%20Writing/Implementing%20a%20Biometric%20Payment%20System%20\(18%20May%202013\).pdf](http://econweb.ucsd.edu/~kamuralidharan/papers/Other%20Writing/Implementing%20a%20Biometric%20Payment%20System%20(18%20May%202013).pdf)

* Shekhar Chandra. 2018. “India’s Biometric Identity Program Is Rooting Out Corruption” *Future Tense*. 3 August. 3 pp. <https://slate.com/technology/2018/08/aadhaar-indias-biometric-identity-program-is-working-but-privacy-concerns-remain.html>

March 31

Designing together

Lynn Barendsen et al. 2013. *The Good Collaboration Toolkit: An Approach to Building, Sustaining, and Carrying Out Successful Collaboration*. Cambridge, MA: The Good Project, Harvard University, pp. 49–79. Available on Canvas.

Robert Klitgaard. 2019. “Engaging Corruption: New Ideas for the International Monetary Fund” *Policy Design and Practice* 2(3): 229–42.

<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/25741292.2019.1612542>

* Matt Andrews, Lant Pritchett, and Michael Woolcock. 2017. *Building State Capability: Evidence, Analysis, Action*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, ch. 7. The book is available free here: <http://www.oxfordscholarship.com/view/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780198747482.001.0001/acprof-9780198747482>

April 7

Governance and anti-corruption

1. Jesus Estanislao. 2014. “Good Governance and Anti-Corruption.” Manila: Institute for Solidarity in Asia. 13 pp. Available on Canvas.

2. Case study: improving city government

Robert Klitgaard and Melissa Mahoney Smith. 2017. “Reforming Mandaue City: The Struggle to Implement a Performance Governance System.” William Davidson Institute, University of Michigan, Case 1-430-497. To be distributed. Please prepare the questions at the end of the case for our discussion in class.

April 14

1. More on Mandaue

Robert Klitgaard. 2019. “Reforming Mandaue City: Overcoming Backsliding” Teaching Case, Claremont Graduate University. August. On Canvas.

Assignment (nothing to write or submit)

Study questions appear at the end of the updated Mandaue case—please prepare them carefully for class discussion.

2. A partnership in public health

Alan M. Trager and Jessica Droste Yagan. 2007. “The Eli Lilly MDR-TB Partnership: Creating Private and Public Value,” Harvard Kennedy School. Available on Canvas.

Assignment (nothing to write or submit)

Study questions appear at the end of the Eli Lilly case—please prepare them carefully.

April 21 and April 28

Presentations of drafts of your course projects

May 5

Review of the course and agenda for the future

Your final course projects are due by 5:00 p.m. on Sunday, **May 10**.

Claremont Graduate University on Course Requirements

Grading

Your grade will be calculated using the following scale. Grades with plus or minus designations are at the professor's discretion.

Letter Grade	Grade Point	Description	Learning Outcome
A	4.0	Complete mastery of course material and additional insight beyond course material	Insightful
B	3.0	Complete mastery of course material	Proficient
C	2.0	Gaps in mastery of course material; not at level expected by the program	Developing
U	0	Unsatisfactory	Ineffective

Continual matriculation at CGU requires a minimum grade point average (GPA) of 3.0 in all coursework taken at CGU. Students may not have more than two incompletes. Details of the policy are found on the Student Services webpage.

https://mycampus.cgu.edu/web/registrar/for-current-students/student-policies#Satisfactory_Academic_Progress

Course Policies

The CGU institutional policies apply to each course offered at CGU. A few are detailed in the space below. Students are encouraged to review the student handbook for the program as well as the policy documentation within the bulletin and on the Registrar's pages.

<http://bulletin.cgu.edu/>

Attendance

Students are expected to attend all classes. Students who are unable to attend class must seek permission for an excused absence from the course director or teaching assistant. Unapproved absences or late attendance for three or more classes may result in a lower grade or an "incomplete" for the course. If a student has to miss a class, he or she should arrange to get notes from a fellow student and is strongly encouraged to meet with the teaching assistant to obtain the missed material. Missed extra-credit quizzes and papers will not be available for re-taking.

Scientific and Professional Ethics

The work you do in this course must be your own. Feel free to build on, react to, criticize, and analyze the ideas of others, but when you do, make it known whose ideas you are working with. You must explicitly acknowledge when your work builds on someone else's ideas, including ideas of classmates, professors, and authors you read. If you ever have questions about drawing the line between others' work and your own, ask the course professor who will give you guidance. Exams must be completed independently. Any collaboration on answers to exams, unless expressly permitted, may result in an automatic failing grade and possible expulsion from

the Program. Additional information on CGU academic honesty is available on the Student Services webpage. <https://cgu.policystat.com/policy/2194316/latest/>

Instructor Feedback and Communication

The best way to get in touch with the professor is via email at robert.klitgaard@cgu.edu. He will respond to email/voice messages within two business days.

Expectations and Logistics

Accommodations for Students with Disabilities

If you would like to request academic accommodations due to temporary or permanent disability, contact Dean of Students and Coordinator for Student Disability Services at DisabilityServices@cgu.edu or 909-607-9448. Appropriate accommodations are considered after you have conferred with the Office of Disability Services (ODS) and presented the required documentation of your disability to the ODS.

Mental Health Resources

Graduate school is a context where mental health struggles can be exacerbated. If you ever find yourself struggling, please do not hesitate to ask for help. If you wish to seek out campus resources, here is some basic information about Monsour.

<https://www.cuc.claremont.edu/mcaps/>

“Monsour Counseling and Psychological Services (MCAPS) is committed to promoting psychological wellness for all students served by the Claremont University Consortium. Our well-trained team of psychologists, psychiatrists, and post-doctoral and intern therapists offer support for a range of psychological issues in a confidential and safe environment.”

Phone 909-621-8202

Fax 909-621-8482

After hours emergency 909-607-2000

Tranquada Student Services Center, 1st floor
757 College Way
Claremont, CA 91711

Title IX

If the professor learns of any potential violation of our gender-based misconduct policy (rape, sexual assault, dating violence, domestic violence, or stalking) by any means, he or she is required to notify the CGU Title IX Coordinator at Deanof.Students@cgu.edu or (909) 607-9448. Students can request confidentiality from the institution, which the professor will communicate to the Title IX Coordinator. If students want to speak with someone confidentially, the following resources are available on and off campus: EmPOWER Center (909) 607-2689, Monsour Counseling and Psychological Services (909) 621-8202, and The Chaplains of the Claremont Colleges (909)621-8685. Speaking with a confidential resource does not preclude students from making a formal report to the Title IX Coordinator if and when they are ready. Confidential resources can walk students through all of their reporting options. They can also provide

students with information and assistance in accessing academic, medical, and other support services they may need.